

Laurel B. Campbell
Suzanne Kuehn
Robyn Maestas



Jocelyn Martinez
Anthony Perko
Jan Schraner
Amy Scoby

211 East D Street | Pueblo, Colorado 81003 | Tel 719-553-2259 | Fax 719-553-2359 | TTY 719-553-2611 | www.pueblo.us

HPC-23-11

August 16, 2023

To: Historic Preservation Commission
From: Wade Broadhead, Senior Planner
Through: Scott Hobson, Acting Director of Planning and Community Development
Location: 406 W 15th Street, Carriage House
Applicant: Rosemount Victorian House Museum
Owner: Same
Year Built: 1891-3
Legal: N 100 FT OF THE E 120 FT LOTS 1 TO 16 INC IN COUNTY ADD, LOTS 1 TO 8 INC BLK A BARTLETT + MILLER, BLK 30 HENRY C BROWNS 1ST ADD
Zone District: R-5, Multiple Office and Residential District Zone District

Synopsis

The Rosemount Mansion (419 W. 14th) was erected in 1891-3 and placed on the National Register of Historic Places in 1974 and added to the Pueblo Inventory of Historic Places in 2002. The carriage house (406 W 15 St.) was listed on the National Register Nomination as part of the landmarked property and currently serves as an event venue. The property is subject to the Standards of Appropriateness and Demolition Standards. The applicant seeks to replace the original Red Vermont Slate roof with a manufactured composite “Eco-Star, stone red” product. Like-to-like reroofs are approved administratively by staff however, due to the rare roofing material and cost to replace the roof, in kind, the applicant is proposing a replacement material with the same color and texture thus requiring HPC review. The Standards of Appropriateness state that a Certificate of Appropriateness is required for “Removal and replacement of any architectural detailing (p.7).” The rare and distinctive slate roofing is a contributing element and unique architectural detail of the mansion and the carriage house.

Analysis

Description of the request

The existing original roof is 130 years old and is deteriorating, leaking in multiple locations and needs to be replaced. Unlike the repair of the main building which was accomplished with a grant from the State of Colorado, State Historical Fund, the applicant is self-funding most of this replacement. The original material has availability issues and costs double that of the Red Vermont Slate (\$400,000 versus 200,000). The applicant proposes hiring Turner Roofing to remove the existing slate roof and install ice and water shield and drip metals and re-roof with Eco-Star stone red composite shingles. The roof measures 54 squares. The roof form will not be altered.

Since the property has received a large State Historical Fund grant, they have a covenant concerning all changes and must be reviewed by staff at History Colorado. The applicant has spoken with History Colorado Staff trained preservation specialist and they have approved the proposed replacement scope of work. The original slate material will be kept by the museum in case it can be utilized for repair on the main Rosemount Mansion roof.

Applicable standards:

Standards of Appropriateness and Demolition Standards, 2005

4.3.2 *Roof Forms*

2. Preserve the original roof form

Guidelines #1, #3, and #4 refer to additions or modifications to the roof form.

The proposed scope of work will just replace the existing slate tiles and there is no proposed change to the roof form or arrangement.

Findings

There is no change to the original roof form and the replacement shingles will closely resemble the original roofing material. The carriage house is accessory to the original mansion and can receive a degree of flexibility with replacement materials given the extreme cost and availability issues of the original Red Vermont Slate. This flexibility has already been approved by preservation specialists at History Colorado who regulate historic alterations statewide.

Recommendations:

Staff recommends approval with standard conditions.

Exhibits

- A. Findings of Fact
- B. Exhibits
- C. Photographs
- D. Applications and attachments

Exhibit A. Findings of Fact for a Certificate of Appropriateness

**FINDINGS OF FACT FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS
REQUIREMENTS SECTION 4-14-11(A):**

1. Conform to the intent and purpose of this code.
 - **Comments:**
Affirmative finding: the proposed replacement roof meets the intent of the code given the cost and difficulty replacing with original slate material.
2. Preserve the special character, interest, and value of the landmark or historic district and its environs.
 - **Comments:**
Affirmative finding, replacement roof maintains the same texture and color as the original.
3. Not be an adverse impact on the exterior features of the landmark.
 - **Comments:**
Affirmative finding, the replacement roof will protect the building while still resembling the original intent of the distinctive roof.

4. The extent to which proposed improvements would be harmonious with the character of a Historic District, and the relationship between the results of such work and the exterior features of other neighboring elements in such Historic District.

Comments:

Not Applicable: The property is not located in a Historic District.

5. Scale, form, and composition of principal facades and relationship to the street.

Comments:

Affirmative finding: the proposed replacement roof will remain nearly identical texture and color to the existing historic roof. Cost and availability make a direct replacement infeasible.



B1. LOCATION



B2. ZONING



B3. Close Up of the Carriage House

(C) SITE PHOTOGRAPHS



View of the Rosemount Mansion for roof comparison



Overview of the Carriage House



View of the rear of the Carriage House



Close up showing missing tile(s)



Eco Star tile comparison for color and texture with original Red Vermont Slate.

7/24/23, 8:24 AM

23-145



City of Pueblo PLACE

7/24/2023

23-145

Historic Preservation

Commission

Status: Active

Submitted On: 7/22/2023

Primary Location

406 W 15TH ST

PUEBLO, CO 81003

Owner

ROSEMOUNT VICTORIAN

HOUSE MUSE

419 W 14TH ST PUEBLO , CO

81003-2707

Applicant

Deb Darrow

719-545-5290

ddarrow@rosemount.org

419 W. 14th St.
Pueblo, CO 81003, CO
81003

Internal

Case Number

HPC-23-11

Planner Assigned

—

Continuances

—

Newspaper Notice Cost

—

Public Notice Costs must be paid by:

—

Public Notice zoning poster must be displayed by:

—

HPC Hearing Information

HPC Hearing Date

08/16/2023

HPC Hearing Results

—

Check box if hearing is a Special Requested Hearing

7/24/23, 8:24 AM

23-145

Application Information

Application Type*	Residential or Non-Residential?*
Certificate of Appropriateness	Non-Residential

Certificate of Compliance is for properties not located in HB zone district and are not contributing to National Historic District Register.

Certificate of Appropriateness

Name of historic resource:*

Rosemount Museum

Provide a short description of the proposed work*

Replace original roof on the Carriage House (on same block, but separate parcel from mansion). Building does not hold the same historic designation as the mansion. Building was completely remodeled in 1980's and became a restaurant. Currently the building is used as a small event venue and for storage. Due to timing with the manufacturing of the original Red Vermont Slate and inflated cost (nearly \$400,000), the museum would like to replace the roof with an almost identical composite which is available immediately and at a substantially more affordable cost (\$255,900). The museum is self-funding the majority of the project with a portion of the funds part of an insurance claim (\$78,363) for the damage. The roof is currently leaking in five locations which is another major consideration in the effort to move more quickly. The museum discussed the project with a Preservation Specialist at the State Historic Fund / Office. They offered their approval of the composite tile as the project upholds the guidelines / standards for historic rehabilitation through the Secretary of the Interior.

Type of Historic Registry*

Local

7/24/23, 8:24 AM

23-145

Scope of work:
(Mark all that apply)

New construction

Addition

Modification

Paint

Awning

Replace or add windows or doors

Sign installation

Reroof

Demolition

Repair of stone or brick

Certificate of economic hardship

Lighting

Infill in a Historic District

Other

Scope of Work Details

Is the reroof like to like materials?*

No

COA Building Information

Existing Building Information:

Area?	Storefront width?
4600	—
Height?	Materials?
30	
Year built? ⓘ	Area? ⓘ
1893	—
Height?	Materials?
—	Eco-Star, stone red 54 squares

Additional information regarding the specific request:

Project consists of tearing off existing slate roof, 54 squares, steep, limited access. Install ice and water shield underlayment, copper valley and drip metals. Re-roof with Eco-Star, stone red, 54 squares with all accessories.

Terms

Applicant Signature*

✓ Debora Darrow
Jul 10, 2023



Proposal

Turner Roofing, LLC
4100 West 8th Street
Pueblo, CO 81003-3966
(719) 545-2400

Alan Snyder
(719) 250-3886
alan@turnerroofingllc.com

Contact: Jim Bradford
Job #J22-5130 - Jim Bradford - 419 W 14th St
419 W 14th St
Pueblo, CO 81003-2707
(719) 281-8810

Estimate No: E22-3604
Estimate Date: 8/10/2022

Roof Type : | Roof Color : , | Drip Edge Color : | Vent Color : | Gutter Color :

Description	Unit of Measure	Qty
Tear-off existing Slate roof, 54 squares, steep, limited access.	Each	1.00
Install Ice and Water shield underlayment, copper valley, and drip metals.	Each	1.00
Re-roof with Eco-Star, Stone Red. 54 squares with all accessories.	Each	1.00

Note: Proposal maybe withdrawn by Contractor, if not accepted within 30 days of the date of this proposal.

Respectively Submitted : Alan Snyder

Sub Total: \$255,975.00
Total: \$255,975.00

All material is guaranteed to be as specified. All work to be completed in a workmanlike manner according to standard practices. Any alteration or deviation from above specifications involving extra costs will be executed only upon written orders, and will become an extra charge over and above the estimate. All agreements contingent upon strikes, accidents or delays beyond our control. Owner is to carry fire, tornado and other necessary insurance.

Comments: 6 weeks for material delivery and 1-2 weeks for start date. Due to size of project a 50% draw will be due at start with balance upon completion.

By signing and dating this Acceptance of Proposal, unless previously withdrawn by Turner Roofing, LLC, the terms and conditions of this Proposal shall be a contract between Owner and Turner Roofing, LLC and Owner authorizes Turner Roofing, LLC to commence work.
INTEREST: If Owner shall fail to make a contract payment when due, the entire contract price shall become immediately due and payable, together with interest at 15% per annum until paid.
ATTORNEY FEES: In the event Contractor retains counsel to collect any sums due it under the terms of this agreement. Owner promises to pay Contractor reasonable attorney fees and costs of collection, in addition to all other sums payable under this Agreement.

Date of Acceptance 6/19/23

Owner: *Daryl Deane*
Director

