

Weston Burrer
Chair

Richard Cherry
Vice Chair

Deborah Espinosa
Secretary

PUEBLO

Historic Preservation Commission

Tanya Jones
Chris Markuson
Marie Schwager
David Webb

211 East D Street | Pueblo, Colorado 81003 | Tel 719-553-2259 | Fax 719-553-2359 | TTY 719-553-2611 | www.pueblo.us

Historic Preservation Commission
City of Pueblo, Colorado
Thursday, April 12, 2012 – 12:00 p.m.
Interim City Council Chambers – 301 West B. Street

Minutes

MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 12:00 p.m. with Chairperson Weston Burrer presiding.

Commissioners Present: Chris Markuson, Tanya Jones, and David Webb,

Commissioners Absent: and Marie Schwager Richard Cherry, and Deborah Espinosa,

Staff Members Present: Jeff Bailey, Assistant City Manager for Development Services, Paul Willumstad, Board Attorney, and Wade Broadhead, Planner.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion to approve the minutes for the Historic Preservation Meeting held January 12th, 2012 by Markuson, second by Webb.

Motion passed 4-0.

PUBLIC HEARING

- A. Local Landmark Designation: HPC #005-2012, 1013 Lake Street**
Application to designate a local landmark

BACKGROUND

Staff Report by Wade Broadhead
Presentation by Wade Broadhead

Synopsis

The owner is requesting local landmark status for their property known as the K.M. Flynn House.

Analysis

The house is located in the far northern edge of the Bessemer neighborhood, but was closely aligned with the Mesa Junction/South Pueblo neighborhood to the north where numerous high ranking steel mill managers,

executives, real estate barons and related trades took up residence. The property has served as a residence since its construction in 1891, although it served as a rental for much of its history. The house is significant as a unique and well preserved one story eclectic Queen Anne residence. The home also represents the same history of foreclosures associated with other 1890s homes on Lake Avenue probably resulting from the depression of 1893. Mrs. K.M. Flynn originally had the house built but she had to take out a loan to pay liens filed on the property immediately after its construction. Mrs. K.M. Flynn never moved into the home and instead lived in the Blocks until she disappears from Pueblo after 1892. Although owned by a prominent businessman, John Mitchell, next, the house remained a rental until 1927.

The home qualifies under landmark Criteria 1a) for having representing the turbulent economic and real estate era speculation boom of the 1890s and endemic foreclosure in Bessemer/Pueblo after the 1892-3 economic crash, with few long term prominent residents until the 1940s. The home also qualifies for nomination under criteria 2a and b as a good example of a late Queen Anne residence since it still retains it's character defining Queen Anne features such as a masonry construction, arched window surrounds, and crushed glass gable end decoration; elaborate shingle work, and a complex roofline. The home is the third adjacent house in what is becoming a late 19th century transitional Lake Street Historic District.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends **APPROVAL** for local landmark nomination.

HEARING

Kim Smith, 1013 Lake Street, appeared and testified in favor of the application.

COMMISSION ACTION

Motion to approve HPC #005-2012 by Markuson, second by Jones.

Motion passed 4-0.

B. Certificate of Appropriateness: HPC #004-2012, 1901 Court Street

Application to repaint a home

BACKGROUND

Staff Report by Wade Broadhead

Staff Presentation by Wade Broadhead

Synopsis

According to Standards of Appropriateness (1.4.1.1) "Any owner proposing to materially alter a designated landmark...must obtain a COA". The owners of the Barndollar Work House have applied to repaint their home. According to the Standards of Appropriateness 4.3.9 *Certificate of Appropriateness* for paint work requires that a proposed paint color conform to a documented historic paint palette, although it does acknowledge that Pueblo's eclectic historic pattern, there can be a significant degree of flexibility in selection of paint colors and patterns." The applicant proposes using one primary color and three accent colors: Blueblood for the primary wall base color, and a manual mix lighter blue for the trim, as well as Forward Fuchsia and Golden Fleece.

Anita's Gold Leaf will be used on accents. The colors were not chosen from any established historic paint palette. The paint style is Sherwin Williams Conflex XL masonry coating, a more industrial grade stucco coating. Silver Creek Painting conducted the work.

Analysis

The Barndollar-Work House was constructed in 1872/73 and is one of the oldest homes in Pueblo and the last existing example of a Second Empire home with a distinctive "Steamboat Gothic" cupola. The home has undergone significant changes, including an application of stucco over the original brick on all facades in the 1920s or 1930s. Unfortunately the landmark designation does not discuss the history of alterations to the home, including the primary alteration the stucco of the entire first story exterior brick walls. It is unknown when the stucco occurred but interviews with the current owners suggest it may have happened in the 1930s, when stucco spread throughout other areas of Pueblo. Stucco is a masonry application.

The owners conducted exhaustive research of similar aged homes along the Eastern Seaboard over the last few years and have presented a number of photographs to document that Early Victorian homes were often very colorful. When conducting paint color research applicants are generally urged to examine earlier paint colors on the home or in the immediate region since home colors could vary from region to region. Although the applicant provided numerous photos of Second Empire homes Staff is uncertain if those photos were from historic districts with approved paint jobs. The applicant in this case did contact staff who urged them to apply for the COA before painting occurred but they did not and staff had to make contact 2-3 times before an application was delivered and by that time the paint job was 60% finished.

Since stucco is a masonry application and it is historic in this case so preservation guidelines state that masonry should not be painted if not already painted. White stucco is akin to fire red brick, and represents the historic stucco color. So whether the original red brick was painted, it no longer matters since the stucco is the exterior masonry system now, and there is no evidence it was ever painted blue. Furthermore, the colors used were not on any approved historic paint palette nor did the applicant's work though their color choice with Staff despite calling before hand and being informed they needed to apply, nor did they stop when contacted. Finally, preservation guidelines state that owners should try and conduct paint analysis on the home to determine historic colors and while the applicant has shown that bright green roof shingle are appropriate they have not shown the presence of the bright blue as the main body color. Had the case proceeded normally staff would have recommended keeping the body color white or similar color since the stucco must be considered to be historic, and allowing 2-3 trim colors from an approved historic paint palette or a manual mix to match colors found through investigation.

RECOMMENDED MOTION

1. Staff recommends **DENIAL** of the proposed paint palette.

HEARING

Van Truan, 1901 Court Street, appeared and testified in favor of the application and presented new National Trust for Historic Preservation paint chips. Staff and the Chair voiced concerns that the paint chips did not match the house as painted and presented in the Staff report.

COMMISSION ACTION

Motion to continue HPC #004-2012 until the May 12, 2012 meeting by Markuson, second by Webb.

Motion passed 4-0.

Old/New Business and Updates

A. Bessemer Neighborhood Historic Context

Broadhead: The study should be done and presented in June. I have received a final draft and am reviewing the document.

B. History Day

Broadhead: I participated as a judge in History Day this March and judged the Documentary category. I will be trying to get the 1st place documentary team to present to City Council this Spring.

C. OAHP Presentation by History Colorado Staff, Dan Corson.

Corson: 15 minute Power Point presentation by Dan Corson about the CLG process, rights, and responsibilities.

ADJOURN

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:20 p.m.