



CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS – CITY HALL
#1 CITY HALL PLACE
Tuesday, July 14, 2020
11:00AM

MINUTES

CALL TO ORDER

Chair Daniel Archibeque called the Civil Service Commission Meeting to order at 11:00AM.

ROLL CALL

Commission Members Present: Dan Archibeque, Sharon Bonner, Erick Javaneau

Administrative and Civil Service Staff Members Present: Robert Jagger, Counsel for the Commission; Bella Trujillo, Assistant HR Director; Manuel Alcala, Civil Service Administrator.

AMENDMENTS TO THE AGENDA

Mr. Archibeque asked if there were any amendments to the agenda. None were voiced.

READING AND APPROVAL OF MINUTES:

Commission Action: Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to dispense with the reading and approve the minutes for the June 3, 2020 regular meeting as distributed.

Roll Call -- Ayes: Archibeque, Bonner, Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

CONSENT AGENDA

The following items are considered routine by the Civil Service Commission and will be passed and approved by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a Commissioner so requests; in which event, the item shall be removed and considered as a regular item.

1. Received and filed the following status reports on current recruitments:
 - a. **Associate Engineer II - Wastewater** (Recruitment due to a reclassification of Associate Engineer I to Associate Engineer II) – The closed recruitment began on July 8, 2020 and ends on July 21, 2020. We received 1 applicant as of the date this agenda was prepared. The written exam is scheduled for August 7, 2020.
 - b. **Emergency Medical Officer** (Recruitment due to anticipated vacancies) – The closed recruitment began on April 12, 2020 and ended on April 25, 2020. We received 9 applicants, and 9 were approved for the exam. The written exam was administered on July 13, 2020.
 - c. **Fire Engineer** (Recruitment due to several employee vacancies) – The closed recruitment began on March 29, 2020 and ended on April 11, 2020. We received 13 applicants and 12 were approved for the exam. The written exam was administered on May 28, 2020. The eligible list was presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification during this meeting.
 - d. **HVAC Technician** (New vacancy created by 2020 Staffing Ordinance #9620) - The open recruitment began on July 1, 2020 and ends on August 1, 2020. We received 0 applicants as of the date this agenda was prepared. The written exam is scheduled for August 14, 2020.
 - e. **Police Captain** (Recruitment due to anticipated vacancy) – The closed recruitment began on April 19, 2020 and ended on May 2, 2020. We received 9 applicants, and all were approved. The written exam was administered on June 18, 2020. The eligible list was presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification during this meeting.
 - f. **Police Payroll Technician** (Recruitment due to an employee retirement) - The closed recruitment began on June 2, 2020 and ended on June 15, 2020. We received 5 applicants and 3 were approved for the exam. The written exam was administered on July 2, 2020. The eligible list was presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification during this meeting.
 - g. **Police Sergeant** (Recruitment due to anticipated vacancies) – The closed recruitment began on April 19, 2020 and ended on May 2, 2020. We received 37 applicants and 33 were approved. The written exam was administered on June 18, 2020. The eligible list was presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification during this meeting.
 - h. **Senior Office Assistant** (Recruitment due to anticipated vacancies) – The closed recruitment began on March 8, 2020 and ended on March 21, 2020. We received 8 applications and 7 were approved for the exam. The written exam, previously scheduled for April 7, 2020, was administered on June 2, 2020 due to the COVID-19 pandemic. The eligibility list was presented to the Civil Service Commission for certification during this meeting.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

CONSENT AGENDA (CONTINUED)

- i. **Wastewater Electrical Specialist** (Vacancy created by an employee promotion) – The open recruitment began on June 10, 2020 and ended on July 12, 2020. We received 4 applications as of the date this agenda was prepared. The written exam is scheduled for July 28, 2020.
 - j. **Wastewater Utility Worker** (Recruitment due to an employee promotion) – The open recruitment began on June 28, 2020 and ends on July 18, 2020. We received 25 applications as of the date this agenda was prepared. The written exam is scheduled for August 5, 2020.
 - k. **Wastewater Utility Worker IV** (Recruitment due to 3 vacancies) – The open recruitment began on June 7, 2020 and ended on July 7, 2020. We received 9 application and 0 were approved for the exam. The staff is waiting for a decision from the hiring manager on how to proceed.
2. Ratified the Commission's letter to Amber Bingaman regarding the removal of her name from the Accountant II eligibility list.
 3. Ratified the Commission's letter to Adam Pruce regarding the removal of his name from the Assistant Fire Chief eligibility list.
 4. Ratified the Commission's letters to Barbara Huber and William Gray regarding the removal of their names from the Deputy Fire Chief eligibility list.
 5. Ratified the Commission's letters to Guy Cruz and Kenneth Maes regarding the removal of their names from the HVAC Technician eligibility list.
 6. Ratified the Commission's letters to Julianne Abagulum, Elisa Cancino, Connie Fix, Jennifer Foute, Jess Fuentes, Christina Garcia, Desiree Gonzales, Melissa Hayward, Terrie Helton, Danita Lopez, Nadia Metoyer, Toni Ousley, Brian Rister, Amanda Rogers, Rebecca Stanley, Debra Stensgaard, Melissa Trevizo, Breon Valdez, Sandra Warfield, Tina Wingate and Deborah Yaden, regarding the removal of their names from the Office Assistant eligibility list.
 7. Ratified the Commission's letters to Walter Allison and Melanie Turner regarding the removal of their names from the Traffic Engineer eligible list.
 8. Ratified the Commission's letters to Daniel Kelly, Justin Martinez and Sean Patrick, regarding the removal of their names from the Utility Worker eligibility list.
 9. Ratified the Commission's letters to Amanda DeBono, Joseph Drouillard and Lorenzo Trujillo regarding the removal of their names from the Water Reclamation Worker eligibility list.
 10. Ratified the Commission's letters to Stephen Fassi and Keith Miller regarding the rejection of their appeal to the content of the Assistant Fire Chief examination.
 11. Ratified the Commission's letters to Jeffrey Capito, William Gronholm and Edric Prijatel regarding their appeals to the content of the Fire Engineer examination.
 12. Ratified the Commissioner's letter to Jeremy Mathews regarding the rejection of his appeal relating to the conduct during the Police Sergeant examination.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

CONSENT AGENDA (CONTINUED)

13. Ratified the Commissioner's letters to Jeremy Mathews and Vince Petkosek regarding the rejection of their appeals relating to the content of the Police Sergeant examination.
14. Ratified the Commission's letter to Melanie Turner regarding the rejection of her appeal to the removal of her name from the Traffic Engineer eligible list.
15. Ratified the Commissioner's letter to Angelo Connelli regarding the rejection of his appeal to be allowed to take the Utility Worker examination.
16. Ratified the Commissioner's letter to Justin Martinez regarding the approval of his appeal relating to being removed from the Utility Worker eligibility list.
17. Ratified the Commissioner's letter to Brian Laut regarding the placement of his name on the re-employment list for Police Patrol Officer.
18. Ratified the Commission's approval of the request by Chief Davenport to waive the 6-month waiting period per Rule 21(a), for Police Sergeant candidates who failed the written exam on June 18/19, 2020.

Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to accept all Consent agenda items as distributed.*

Roll Call -- Ayes: Archibeque, Bonner, Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously.

REGULAR AGENDA

1. Submission of the eligible list for Fire Engineer
Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to approve and certify the eligible list for the class title of Fire Engineer*
Roll Call—Ayes- Archibeque, Bonner, and Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously.
2. Submission of the eligible list for Police Captain
Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to approve and certify the eligible list for the class title of Police Captain*
Roll Call—Ayes- Archibeque, Bonner, and Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously
3. Submission of the eligible list for Police Payroll Technician
Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to approve and certify the eligible list for the class title of Police Payroll Technician*
Roll Call—Ayes- Archibeque, Bonner, and Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously
4. Submission of the eligible list for Police Sergeant
Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to approve and certify the eligible list for the class title of Police Sergeant*
Roll Call—Ayes- Archibeque, Bonner, and Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

REGULAR AGENDA (CONTINUED)

5. Submission of the eligible list for Senior Office Assistant
Commission Action: *Mr. Javaneau seconded by Ms. Bonner, moved to approve and certify the eligible list for the class title of Senior Office Assistant*

Roll Call—Ayes- Archibeque, Bonner, and Javaneau. Motion carried unanimously

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

1. The Civil Service Administrator presented the Mid-Year Report, including Civil Service Office precedence, achievements/challenges, and goals.

CS Office Precedence

Manuel Alcala stated that what the Civil Service Office does is spelled out in the Civil Service Rules, more specifically under Rules 4, 10, 15, and Sec 6-1-4(3). He continued by saying the Office's main priority is customer service and partnering with Human Resources, hiring managers, etc. to become one mission, one message, and one recruiting team. We are trying to be clear, consistent, ethical, transparent, fair, caring, helpful, and Professional will all business partners and job applicants. Alcala said that another priority is standardized processes within the office to help get all the work done, especially with a limited staffing. Metrics is another priority because it helps paint a picture of the Civil Service function. The final priority is professional development because it helps with customer service, professionalism, participation in growth, office image, and makes for an overall happy team.

Achievements/Challenges

Alcala stated that in years past, the Office didn't have enough money to fund some essential services; but explained that the biggest achievement in the budget is city administration support of the Civil Service function. He said that because of this support, we are now getting the funding for critical areas such as, professional services, recruitment/outreach, and exam administration software.

Alcala said the biggest challenges are COVID-19 and staffing. He said that Civil Service has a very dedicated staff but reiterated that insufficient staffing is an overarching theme. We continue to request the funding for more staff to fully meet our commitments.

Civil Service's focus in marketing is social media and online marketing, outreach recruitment, and researching other recruiting venues. Alcala displayed a pie chart showing where people first saw Civil Service job posts and said that most respondents first saw City jobs through Government Jobs/City Website, Indeed, and word of mouth, in that order. Alcala stated that the Office has over 70 contacts where Civil Service advertises. In regard to Marketing and outreach challenges, Alcala listed staffing and hard-to-fill jobs.

Alcala displayed a chart with a near 2,200 Record-Breaking applicants in 2019. He said that another great achievement was improved communications through NeoGov, which has helped limit appeals to applicant rejections. He displayed a chart showing how Civil Service loses candidates during the process and said that we lose most candidates at the first step of the process and primarily because they simply fail to submit a complete application. Alcala also addressed the minority and female distribution of applicants throughout the process.

Alcala talked about the evolution of examinations over the last 4 years; in 2016, the entire process was done by hand; in 2018, the test was taken by hand but graded electronically; and in 2020 the whole process is now computer-based with vast reporting capabilities. He stated that data analysis is a challenge.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS (CONTINUED)

Alcala said that a big achievement for Civil Service is being able to track many facets of the operation, but because it is labor intensive to analyze the data and take corrective action, there is room for improvement.

Goals

Alcala indicated that a goal is to work on outdated rules and added that he would like to present a proposal to change Rules 18, 19 and 20 in the next meeting because these rules currently focus on paper/pencil exams. The change would facilitate computer-based exam administration and remove outdated language. He also reminded the Commission of a previous discussion relating to engaging a taskforce made up of department leaders who would be tasked with reviewing and recommending rule changes. He said that the Office would be proceeding with this project and would present other requests for rule changes in the future.

Alcala said that we have no system in place to address loss of out-of-town applicants, especially in light of COVID-19. He articulated that a potential solution is using our online examination system (TestGenius) and an exam proctoring service to do remote testing. The proctoring service would help with the many security/integrity concerns that come with online testing. He requested authorization to proceed with this project.

Alcala indicated that there is no Firefighter physical ability test (PAT) as a part of the civil service process. Currently, candidates have to take the Candidate Physical Ability Test (CPAT) and present their certificate at time of interview. Alcala said the test is a big expense to candidates (\$135) and added that over 14% of removals at the interview are due to the CPAT. The fire department requests an in-house PAT. The approval would (1) bring the Fire PAT under the purview of the commission, (2) limit candidate travel to the exam site, and (3) alleviate the expense to candidates. Alcala said that the Office had reached out to FPSI, a vendor under the parent company of Biddle Consulting Group. FPSI previously developed the police PAT, is used in dispatcher testing, and is the developer of TestGenius. He said that this option would cost less than \$30,000. He requested authorization to proceed with this project.

Alcala offered that continuing efforts to spread the word will be a challenge until we have full-time staffing. Alcala said that in light of COVID 19, the Office needs to do adaptive community outreach to keep people safe while reaching out to as many people as possible.

Discussion

Erick Javaneau asked about the chieftain and how advertising could be made more effective. Alcala explained that the Office had previously requested removing language from the rules that force us to advertise through the chieftain because it was not a good ROI at the time; the proposal was rejected by City Council. Alcala said that the chieftain now partners with ZipRecruiter, increasing job exposure significantly. Javaneau commented that it's much more widespread and cost effective to advertise through ZipRecruiter.

Archibeque said that the process has come a long way since 2009 because even though we lose many applicants along the way, more people are applying thanks to NeoGov. Archibeque said that they will support Civil Service through whatever changes are necessary to move forward. Archibeque believes a big obstacle is still funding. He believes that Civil service has a dedicated staff and agrees that staffing is still a problem. He is aware of the staffing issue being brought to the attention of the City Administration but requested that Alcala follow up with City Administration. Alcala said that the budget for 2021 had been submitted, which includes budget cuts; however, he said that the Chief of Staff encouraged him to continue asking for the additional staff member.

CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES
July 14, 2020

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS (CONTINUED)

Alcala asked for feedback specifically on the remote testing software and moving forward with the fire PAT. Archibeque said they had done remote testing before. Alcala confirmed that we had done so via Zoom, but the venue was limited to one person at a time and added that the idea is to have the ability to test many applicants at one time. He requested their approval for this. Robert Jagger confirmed by saying that Alcala needs approval to move forward. Archibeque approved.

Alcala then asked if there were any concerns with the physical ability test for firefighters. Archibeque agreed with it but said he didn't feel that he can do much to help. Jagger said that Alcala was asking for verbal approval. Javaneau asked if it would be a good idea to have people take the test at different times. Jagger explained that everyone has to do it at the same time. Archibeque commented that if changes will save money he is on board. Jagger asked Deputy Chief Harner to speak. Harner explained that the CPAT is costly, which is probably why we lose some candidates. He added that another issue is that CPAT is weighted against females with less upper-body strength. Harner said that the department could fund the change and it would be good for the fire department to have its own test. Jagger said that under the civil service rules, the City would only be allowed to use one test, the in-house PAT or the CPAT, and not be selective on which candidates could take one or the other. Jagger asked if there would be any problem if this new test was the only test. Harner said no. All approved the changes for the fire department test

2. The next regular meeting of the Civil Service Commission was scheduled for August 11, 2020, at 11:00 A.M. The meeting will be held in the City Council Chambers, #1 City Hall Place.

INFORMATIONAL ITEMS

1. Employee Status Report for June 2020

ADJOURN: 12:04PM


Commission Chair