

Weston Burrer  
Chair

Richard Cherry  
Vice Chair

Deborah Espinosa  
Secretary

# PUEBLO



## Historic Preservation Commission

Tanya Jones

Chris Markuson

Marie Schwager

David Webb

---

211 East D Street | Pueblo, Colorado 81003 | Tel 719-553-2259 | Fax 719-553-2359 | TTY 719-553-2611 | www.pueblo.us

### *Historic Preservation Commission*

City of Pueblo, Colorado

Thursday, November 10, 2011 – 12:00 p.m.

Interim City Council Chambers – 301 West B. Street

### Minutes

#### MEETING CALLED TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at 12:00 p.m. with Chairperson Weston Burrer presiding.

**Commissioners Present:** Richard Cherry, Deborah Espinosa, Tanya Jones, Chris Markuson, and David Webb.

**Commissioners Absent:** Marie Schwager

**Staff Members Present:** Jeff Bailey, Assistant City Manager for Development Services, Paul Willumstad, Board Attorney, and Wade Broadhead, Planner.

#### APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Motion to approve the minutes for the Historic Preservation Public Hearing held on October 13, 2011 by Markuson, second by Webb.

**Motion passed 6-0.**

#### PUBLIC HEARING

**A. Certificate of Appropriateness: HPC #025-2011, 1114 & 1118 Russ Avenue, Edison School**

Application to replace a t-lock shingle roof with a metal roof.

(Continued from the October 13<sup>th</sup> hearing)

#### BACKGROUND

Staff Report by Wade Broadhead

#### Synopsis

The subject property is located in the East Mesa neighborhood immediately north of the steel mill. The Edison School is a National Register property constructed in 1909 and co designed by Dr. Richard Corwin and local Pueblo architect J.M. Gile for the instruction of left handed students in an innovative and creative cottage 'unit' design. The nomination covers six buildings; the smaller cottage units and the main school

buildings. The initial roofing material is unknown but photos from the 1970s show asbestos diamond shingles. Cedar shake or Spanish tile would have been other probably original roofing materials given CF and I's proclivity for Spanish revival architecture. In January of 2011 the roofing material was a brown t-lock shingle. After examining the 1938 photos of the school (and undated earlier photos) staff could not determine what the roofing material was because of the photo quality.

The Edison School was landmarked under the address of 900 W. Mesa in 1985 and at some point the address changed to 1114 and 1118 Russ Avenue (the side street). This discrepancy meant that the initial building permit did not trigger planning review. However, the roofer/owner received a notice of violation of an apparent construction yard due to the roofing materials which sat on the site for over 3 months. This notice was sent April 1 of 2011 from City Code Enforcement. When planning staff realized the confusion over the address they visited the site and informed the roofer to stop work and apply for a COA right away because the replacement material may not meet the guidelines. The roofer finished the outlying unit buildings with a red/maroon corrugated roof and left the primary central building with its original roofing material. Staff indicated that a metal roof on a 1909 historic school would be problematic and against the guidelines; a shingle pattern would be more appropriate.

### Analysis

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for roofs state, they **do not** recommend, "the roof and roofing materials which are important in defining the overall historic character of the building so that, as a result, the character is diminished. Replacing historic roofing material instead of repairing or replacing only the deteriorated material. Changing the type or color of roofing materials." The Standard of Appropriateness are silent on roof replacement on institutional buildings but the section on residential roof replacement states that "the appearance depends more on the color and the apparent unit size of the roofing than the exact material" (Section 4.3.8). Metal roofing can be appropriate in some cases if the unit sizes are similar and closely resemble the original material.

Due to the confusion over the address staff can sympathize with the purchase of metal roofing and installation. Roofs are generally semi temporary and change often due to Pueblo's hail belt location. An acceptable replacement roof for the Edison School would have been standard shake like asphalt shingles, or tile if that was the original roofing material. There is no evidence that this roof was originally constructed out of standing seam metal and it is an inappropriate roof due to its in appropriate unit size from shake, diamond, or tile. A 1987 Chieftain photo shows what looks like an asbestos diamond pattern roof.

Staff recommends leaving the five buildings with metal roofs due to the problems with the address, but does not recommend approval for the continuation of an inappropriate material for the central building. Staff notified the applicant of the problem in April, and they continued to execute the reroof. When the next reroof occurs the applicant can add a single style roof across the entire six building complex that is tile, shake, or composite asphalt shingle after being approved by HPC.

### RECOMMENDED MOTION

Staff recommends **Approval for metal roof on the existing buildings, and denial for a metal corrugated roof on the central building.**

## **HEARING**

**Mike McCafferty, Main Electric, appeared** and testified in favor of the application.

Mr. McCafferty states that the property is owned in a 60/40 partnership between Mr. Brett Verna and Main Electric. Mr. Verna was the sole decision maker on adding a metal roof.

## **COMMISSION ACTION**

Motion to approve HPC #025-2011 to allow metal roofing on all buildings by Webb, second by Cherry.

**Motion failed 3-3.**

Motion to allow the existing metal on the accessory structures to remain and to reroof the central building with a compliant material to the Secretary of Interior standards by Markuson, second by Cherry.

**Motion passed 5-1 (Webb dissenting).**

### **B. Certificate of Appropriateness: HPC #028-2011, 201 W. Lamkin, Unit #205**

Application to add a new deck.

**(Continued to December 8, 2011 hearing-applicant was not present)**

## **Old/New Business and Updates**

*Chairman Burrer states for the record that he will recuse himself from the remainder of the meeting to avoid any appearance of impropriety as he is linked to the Memorial Hall/City Hall project.*

1. City Hall/Memorial Hall Update-Bill Zwick, Landscape Architect and Project Manager for Memorial Hall.

Zwick: As you know we redid the roof and have since received funding from the State Historic Fund to do the exterior renovation for Memorial. I may be coming back to the Commission in December. We also received a grant from CDOT to help with the widening Grand Avenue and site improvements on the City Hall/Memorial Hall lot. There will be an addition to the back of Memorial Hall. The addition will house the dressing rooms, green rooms, lockers, showers and restrooms. Memorial Hall and the addition will be clearly separated by alcoves. The new addition will have a lot of the same elements as Memorial Hall but will be unique as well. The color scheme will be similar with a tan/blonde brick and similar to the colors of the terra cotta. The building will have a double cornice.

## **ADJOURN**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:14 p.m.